

SURVEY OF INTRINSIC/EXTRINSIC MOTIVATION, JOB SATISFACTION AND JOB PERFORMANCE IN UNIVERSITY LIBRARIES IN NORTH-CENTRAL, NIGERIA

KATAMBA, A. S. (Ph.D)

Department of Library & Information Technology,
Federal University of Technology
Minna – Niger State, Nigeria

Email: s.katamba@futminna.edu.ng

Phone No: +234-703-870-6880

Abstract

The study investigated the relationships among intrinsic, extrinsic motivation, job satisfaction and job performance in University Libraries in North-Central Nigeria. The objectives of the study are to find the strength of the relationships among intrinsic / extrinsic motivation, job satisfaction and job performance as well as determining the contribution of intrinsic, extrinsic motivation and job satisfaction to job performance in University libraries in Nigeria. Null hypotheses formulated include: there is no significant relationships among intrinsic / extrinsic motivation and job satisfaction to job performance. There is no significant contribution of intrinsic / extrinsic motivation and job satisfaction to job performance. The target population of the study consisted of professional and para-professional staff in functional University libraries in North-Central Nigeria. The entire population of professional and para-professional staff in the functional university libraries in the zone was adopted. The modified instrument tagged: "Intrinsic, Extrinsic Motivation Job Satisfaction, Job Performance Questionnaire" (IEMJSJPQ) was administered on the two categories of staff in University libraries in the zone. A Statistical Package for Social Science version 17 was used to conduct the statistical analysis. The critical value of 0.125 was used as basis to test the null hypotheses. Multiple correlation coefficient and regression models were the statistical tools used to test and analyzed the formulated null hypotheses. The findings showed weak relationships among intrinsic, extrinsic motivation and job satisfaction but strong relationships existed between extrinsic motivation and job performance. There was no significant contribution among intrinsic, extrinsic motivation and job satisfaction to job performance of library staff in functional university libraries in North-Central Zone of Nigeria. The study recommends that the management of the universities in the zone should emphasize on intrinsic motivation such as work itself, recognition and opportunities for achievement so that library personnel can make positive contribution to university libraries.

Keywords: Intrinsic/Extrinsic Motivation; Job Satisfaction; Job Professional and Performance; Universities Libraries; North-Central Nigeria.

Introduction

An organization or institution usually consists of group of people working together for the attainment of set objectives. This translates to mean that in every organization or institution, there are stated objectives to be achieved. The stated objectives could adequately be achieved when human and material resources of such an organization or institution are properly managed.

Motivation as a concept, is concerned with the aspect of human life that energies, propels and stimulates human beings to change behaviour for the attainment of an organization's goals/objectives, thereby achieving higher productivity. According to Etubi and Ikekhai (2007),

motivation is regarded as the use of incentives to person from whom activity is needed or required. They further postulate various approaches adopted to motivate staff to perform efficient job during the retrospective conversion exercise. These approaches include creation of adequate awareness on the benefits of the project to staff participating in the exercise as well as community. Other approaches include use of financial incentives, creation and maintenance of a conducive atmosphere for the project team.

Motivation could be intrinsic and extrinsic. The intrinsic motivation is the behaviour exhibited from the performance of job e.g. work itself, recognition, achievement, etc. The extrinsic motivation is the behaviour a worker exhibits so as to get reward. It is the offering of reward to a subordinate by supervisor or manager e.g. pay, promotion, working conditions (Akanbi, 2011). In a study of the relationship between rewards and employees' performance in the non-profit organizations in Pakistan, Hafiza, Shah, Jamsheed and Zaman (2011) classified motivational factors into two areas: intrinsic rewards and extrinsic rewards. The intrinsic rewards include empowerment and autonomy, recognition and appreciation and challenging tasks. The extrinsic rewards include pay, bonuses, fringe benefits and promotions.

Library as one of the recognized institutions in the society is not left out in the need to motivate staff through recognition, praises, prompt payment of salaries, increase in workers' salaries, staff training, participatory management, effective communication and free flow of information. Management of library as well as library administrators can motivate workers to perform efficient job by making library work more challenging and interesting as well as appreciating their good performance; promotion, taking care of their welfare, staff development and participatory management (Ugwuanyi, 2011).

Since motivation is aimed at a positive change in behavioural pattern of workers' performance, there is the need for a worker to give his/her personal assessment on the extent of motivation received or enjoyed based on job performance, which is usually a function of job satisfaction. Job satisfaction therefore, is workers' perception, assessment or attitude towards their job based on the degree/extent of motivation received, and thus job satisfaction is the direct product of motivation (Boluade, 2004). A low or high level of job satisfaction is a function of the extent of motivation derived by workers; thus a hard-working staff that received low level of satisfaction or dissatisfaction would develop negative attitude towards not only the job but also towards the boss or fellow workers (Bamigboye, Buraimo and Ajani, 2006; Tella, Ayeni and Popoola, 2007). Job satisfaction is linked with motivation and thus satisfaction leads to performance.

Villamova, Austin and Borman (2005) cited Austin *et al* (1991) to have described job performance "as that aspect of work behaviour domain that is of relevance to job and the organization's objectives". Job performance varies from organizations to organizations. For example, jobs performed in bank include: receiving and payment of cash to customers, balancing of accounts, management of bank records, etc. Jobs performed in library include cataloging and classification of materials, provision of reference services, charging and discharging of library materials to users, etc.

Job responsibilities of personnel in an academic library as per professional staff include book selection, ordering and acquisition of library materials, provision of reference and circulation services, library instructions as well as cataloging and classification of library materials. The

para-professional staff job responsibilities include filing cards into catalogue cabinets, writing and checking orders; providing assistance to readers in the location of books; stock editing, etc (Maduekwe & Ajale, 2000). Job performance in a library is not only geared towards meeting users' information needs but also serve as criteria for promotion.

From researcher's observation, it was discovered that library personnel performance was low and this could be attributed to inadequate motivation as personnel feel not satisfied with the job. However, this study seeks to find out the relationships among motivational factors, job satisfaction and job performance among professionals and para-professionals in university libraries within the North-Central, Nigeria.

Statement of the Problem

University libraries are established to support learning, teaching, research and service to community. University library personnel (professionals and para-professionals) are expected to perform the statutory functions so as to achieve the set objectives of their university library. These functions include selection and acquisition, processing, organization, cataloguing and classification, provision of reference services, bibliographic services, computerization of library services, etc. For these services/functions to be effectively performed by professional and para-professional staff, they need to be adequately motivated. University Management needs to adequately motivate library personnel by way of making job interesting, recognize and praise staff for good work; provide financial incentives, training, good leadership styles, free flow of information communicated among personnel, etc. Motivation encourages performance which in turn leads to job satisfaction and consequently stimulates high performance and productivity. Where motivation is lacking, staff will end up not performing their job well (Boluade, 2004), as research findings have shown inconsistencies in the relationships or otherwise among motivation, job satisfaction and job performance of workers. In order to ascertain the inconsistencies in the research findings, it is necessary to empirically investigate the relationships among intrinsic / extrinsic motivation, job satisfaction and job performance of library personnel in universities in North-Central, Nigeria.

Objectives of the Study

The main objective of the study is to determine the strength of relationship and contribution of intrinsic/extrinsic motivation, job satisfaction and job performance of professional and paraprofessionals in university libraries in North-Central, Nigeria. The specific objectives of this study are to determine the:

- (i) Relationships among intrinsic/extrinsic motivation, job satisfaction and job performance of library personnel in university in North-Central, Nigeria;
- (ii) Significant contribution of intrinsic / extrinsic motivation and job satisfaction to job performance of library personnel in university in North-Central, Nigeria.

Research Questions

The following questions were raised to provide answer to the study:-

- (i) What are the degree of relationships among intrinsic/extrinsic motivation, job satisfaction and job performance of library personnel in university libraries?
- (ii) What are the extent of contribution of intrinsic / extrinsic motivation and job satisfaction to job performance of library personnel?

Hypotheses

The following null-hypotheses were formulated and tested at 0.05 level of significance:-

Ho₁: There are no significant relationships among intrinsic, extrinsic motivation, job satisfaction and job performance of library personnel,

Ho₂: There is no significant contribution of intrinsic, extrinsic motivation, job satisfaction to job performance of library personnel.

Literature Review

Akanbi (2011) investigated the influence of extrinsic and intrinsic motivation on job performance of 100 workers of flour mills, Lagos using questionnaire. Two hypotheses (of significant relationship between extrinsic/extrinsic motivation and job performance) were tested using PPMC at 0.05 level of significance. The study found a positive relationship between extrinsic motivation and job performance, though there was no relationship between intrinsic motivation and job performance. This means that when there is an increase or decrease in salary, allowances, etc of workers, there will be an increase or decrease in workers' performance respectively.

Natolooka and Otengo (2011) investigated the cause of labour turnover in relation to job satisfaction and the negative/positive effects on employees' performance in local governments in Uganda. The case study was used to examine seven rural sub-counties and four urban divisions. Two methods (questionnaire and in-depth interviews) were used for data collection. Data were analysed using frequencies, tables and percentages. The results of the study showed that:- there was poor working conditions (which are characterized) by poor/low salary, accommodation, facilities, recreational and social amenities and welfare facilities. It also revealed that there exist inadequate opportunities for promotion and training; job insecurity; poor job design; stressful work environment and poor management style. This situation has had both negative and positive effect on employees' performance; many employees were demotivated and lack job satisfaction as well as commitment which led to less productivity. The effects were the promotion of internal staff and employing new innovative staff.

A collaborative research work was conducted by Zakaria, Hussain, Noordin, Sawal and Zakaria (2011) on the relationship between reward practice and employees' performance. The population consist Toyota 35 centre, SP Salaton and Otomobial Sdn Kedah. The study adopted non – probability convenience sampling and 82 copies of questionnaire were distributed to employees on their perception of the reward practice related to organizational performance. The collected data were analyzed using the SPSS version 16.0 through descriptive data and correlation. Pearson correlation was used to test the hypotheses. The findings showed that there was no significant relationship between employees' perception on transparency of reward practice and employees' performance. All factors were not significant to contribute to employees' performance.

Olusola (2011) investigated intrinsic motivation, job satisfaction and self-efficacy as predictors of job performance of 1100 industrial workers in Ijebu zone of Ogun State, Nigeria. The aim of the study was to examine the contribution of self-efficacy, intrinsic motivation and job performance. Simple random sampling technique was used to select 300 workers from the two industries. Four instruments: Intrinsic Motivation Inventory (IMT), Self-Efficiency Scale (SES) and Annual Performance Evaluation Form (APER). Multiple regression analysis was used to test the hypotheses at 0.05 level of significance. The results showed that self-efficacy, intrinsic

motivation and job satisfaction collectively and individually will predict the job performance of industrial workers.

As part of the investigation conducted by Olorunsola (2010), personal/ demographic characteristics were also examined. The results of the investigation on the personal characteristics of administrative staff in the government-owned universities of South West, Nigeria revealed the following. There was no significant difference in the working experience of male and female administrative staff. On the other hand, age and gender significantly influence job satisfaction. Personal working experience and type of university influence job performance of administrative staff.

Saka and Haruna (2013) examined the relationship between staff development and job performance of personnel in branch libraries of University of Maiduguri. The study adopted the entire population of 47 personnel in all the 15 branch libraries. Pearson Product Moment Correlation and regression model were statistical tools used to test the four null-hypotheses. The study found no significant relationship between formal education and job performance. Significant relationship existed between seminars/conferences and job performance as well as workshop attendance and job performance. The study further revealed high strength of relationship among formal education, seminars/conferences, workshop attendance and job performance with R-value of 60%.

In a situation where poor performance is noticed from employees or an employee's performance is below expectation, it would be assumed that the management is unable to recruit qualified staff, provide working materials and above all handle staff welfare properly, etc (Boluade, 2004). The manager or the immediate supervisor needs to evaluate/appraise subordinates' performance on regular basis so as to determine pay and promotional decision, develop plan for correcting any deficiency and review employee's career plan (Dessler, 2011).

Methodology

Survey method was used for the study because data were collected so as to describe and interpret the existing relationships among motivational factors, job satisfaction and job performance of professional and para-professional library personnel in universities in North-Central, Nigeria. Survey research was used because of the large area covered. Data were collected from the entire population of professional and para-professional library staff in all the surveyed universities in North-Central, Nigeria.

The target population of the study comprised 301 professional and para-professional library personnel (160 professionals and 141 para-professionals) spread across the 17 fully operational universities in North-Central, Nigeria. The fully-operational universities within the context of this study are the established universities that have library personnel on ground for not less than one year as at March, 2012. The population distribution cuts across both government and privately-owned universities in the North-Central, Nigeria. See appendix at the last page.

The entire population of 301 library personnel in all the functional university libraries in North-central, Nigeria as at March 2012 was adopted for the study and so there was no sampling. The modified instruments tagged Intrinsic Extrinsic Motivation and Job Satisfaction, Job Performance Questionnaire (IEMJSJPO) was designed into two sets comprises four likert scales (Strongly Agree - 4, Agree - 3, Disagree - 2, Strongly Disagree - 1). The copies of questionnaire were

administered on the entire population of professional and para-professional staff in all the functional university libraries in North-Central geo-political zone of Nigeria. Parts of Olorunsola (2010) questionnaire on job performance were adopted for the study. Influential statistical tools such as Multiple Correlation Coefficient and Regression Models were used to test the null hypotheses of the strength of the relationships as well as the contribution of intrinsic / extrinsic motivation and job satisfaction to job performance of library personnel respectively. Statistical Package for Social Science (SPSS) version 17 was used to conduct the statistical analysis of data. The critical value of 0.125 was used as a standard for testing the two null hypotheses.

Results

Out of 301 copies of questionnaire administered, 256 (85%) were filled, returned and found usable.

Table 2: Respondents by gender

Gender	Frequency	Percentage (%)
Male	149	58
Female	107	42
Total	256	100

Out of 256 respondents, 149 (58%) were males while 107 (42%) were females. This would imply that male and female personnel in the university libraries could be said to be fairly represented in the study which thus balanced up the gender consideration.

Testing of hypotheses

Hypothesis 1: There are no significant relationships among intrinsic, extrinsic motivation, job satisfaction and job performance of library personnel in universities in North-Central, Nigeria.

The sub-aggregate of motivational factors for intrinsic and extrinsic motivation along with the score for job satisfaction and job performance were correlated with the aid of the Pearson product moment correlation coefficient for the test of this hypothesis. The summary of the correlation coefficients between the variables is presented in a square matrix in Table 2.

Table 2: Relationships among intrinsic, extrinsic motivation, job satisfaction and job performance of library personnel in universities in North-Central, Nigeria

Variables	Job satisfaction	Intrinsic motivation	Extrinsic motivation	Job performance
Job satisfaction	1	.515	.508	.105(ns)
Intrinsic motivation	.515	1	.642	.073(ns)
Extrinsic motivation	.508	.642	1	.125(*)
Job performance	.105(ns)	.073(ns)	.125(*)	1
N	256	256	256	256

Key: *: Correlation is significant at the 0.05 level (2-tailed) 0.125

ns: Correlation is not significant at the 0.05 level (2-tailed) 0.073 & 0.105

From the observed multiple correlation in the table 2, job satisfaction is not significantly correlated with job performance of the library personnel. The observed multiple correlation between the two variables (job satisfaction and job performance) was 0.105 compared with the critical value of 0.125 at the 252 degree of freedom. Though job satisfaction was significantly

correlated with intrinsic motivation and extrinsic motivation, the relationship with job performance was not statistically significant. There was no significant relationship between intrinsic motivation and job performance of the library personnel involved in the study. However, the performance of the personnel was significantly correlated with their extrinsic motivation. The observed coefficient of correlation between the two variables is 0.125 and the significance was obtained at the 0.05 level ($P \leq 0.05$). The observed relationship between intrinsic and extrinsic motivation was very high, positive and significant as indicated in the table. The two variables were highly and significantly correlated with the job satisfaction of the personnel. Therefore, on the basis of the relationship among job performance, Job satisfaction, intrinsic motivation, there was enough evidence to accept the null-hypothesis but on the basis of the interrelationship of the other variables, the null- hypothesis was rejected.

Hypothesis 2: There is no significant contribution of intrinsic, extrinsic motivation and job satisfaction to job performance of library personnel

The linear regression procedure was used with least square method. Performance of the library personnel was used as the dependent variables while the sub-aggregate of motivational factors (intrinsic, extrinsic motivation) and job satisfaction were used as the independent variables. The use of the regression model for the test was to establish the functional relationship or the contribution of the independent variables to the job performance of library personnel in universities in North-Central, Nigeria.

Table 3: Regression estimates of the contribution of intrinsic, extrinsic motivation and job satisfaction to job performance of library personnel in north-central, Nigeria

Variables	Unstandardized		Standardized	T	Sig.
	Coefficients		Coefficients		
	B	Std. Error	Beta		
(Constant)	2.262608	0.228837		11.47576	8.74E-25
Job satisfaction	0.064394	0.075078	0.064959	0.857695	0.391879
Intrinsic motivation	-0.03653	0.09525	-0.03268	-0.38348	0.701689
Extrinsic motivation	0.109057	0.082663	0.112	1.319293	0.188273

Dependent Variable: Job performance

From the observed significant levels for the contribution of each of the variables shown on the table, the selected parameters could not be said to be significant determinant of the personnel's performance of their respective jobs in the surveyed university libraries. The functional relationship between the dependent variable (job performance) and the independent variables (intrinsic, extrinsic motivation and job satisfaction) could be expressed as $Y = a + bx_1 + bx_2 + bx_3$, where b represents the estimated coefficient and x for the independent variables. With the model, the functional relationship between the variables could be expressed as job performance = 2.262 + 0.064394 job satisfaction - 0.03653 intrinsic motivation + 0.109057 extrinsic motivation. But the observation here did not reveal that any of the independent variables could be said to be a significant determinant of job performance by the personnel. There is adequate evidence to accept the null hypothesis. This is because the contribution of the independent variable could not be said to be significant factors of the personnel's job performance in the selected libraries of the North-Central, Nigeria.

Discussion of Findings

Multiple correlation was used to test the first hypothesis which states that “there is no significant relationship among intrinsic, extrinsic motivation, job satisfaction and job performance of library personnel”. The result revealed that job satisfaction and intrinsic motivation were not significantly correlated with the job performance of library personnel. The extrinsic motivation which comprises of staff development, financial incentives, communication and participatory management were the components found to be significantly correlated with the job performance of the library personnel.

The findings of hypothesis one, corroborates Akanbi (2011) and Saka and Haruna (2013). Akanbi (2011) surveyed the influence of extrinsic and intrinsic motivation on employees' performance and the result showed positive relationship between extrinsic motivation and job performance. On the other hand, Saka and Haruna (2013) investigated the relationship between staff development and job performance among personnel in branch libraries, University of Maiduguri. The result of the study showed high significant relationship between staff development and job performance of library staff in University of Maiduguri.

Regression model was used to test the second hypothesis on significant contribution of intrinsic, extrinsic motivation and job satisfaction to job performance of the library personnel. Though extrinsic motivation and job satisfaction were found to have positive contribution to the job performance of the personnel but such contribution of these variables were found not to be the major determinants of job performance of personnel in the university libraries. Intrinsic motivation was found to have a negative contribution. However, such contribution was found not to be statistically significant. The null hypothesis was therefore accepted. The result corroborates those of Notolooka and Otenga (2011) as well as Zakaria, Hussaini, Noordim, Sawwal and Zakaria (2011) but disagree with those of Olusola (2011) and Olorunsola (2010). Notolooka and Otenga (2011) found that both inadequate intrinsic/extrinsic motivation, job satisfaction have led to lack of commitment and productivity among employees in a local government area in Uganda. The result reveals inadequate intrinsic/extrinsic motivation which includes job security, job design, opportunities for promotion and training, management styles, salary and communication. Zakaria, Hussain, Noordim, Sawal and Zakaria (2011) reported that all factors were not significant to contribute to employees' performance. In disagreement with the findings of hypothesis two, Olusola (2011) found motivational factors and job satisfaction as important factors in predicting job commitment/involvement of workers in various organizations in Nigeria. Olorunsola (2010) found “achievement” and “leadership quality” as best predictors of job satisfaction and job performance. It should be noted however that “achievement” is an intrinsic motivation while “leadership quality” is an extrinsic motivation; while job satisfaction and self efficacy are regarded as predictors of job performance whether individually or collectively.

Conclusion

Based on the findings, the study concludes that:

- (i) Recognition, work itself and achievement were not adequate, hence low job satisfaction and job performance existed. The strength of their relationship tends to be weak. Both intrinsic and extrinsic motivations are moving towards different directions (divergent).
- (ii) Inadequate intrinsic/extrinsic motivation, low job satisfaction can neither contribute nor serve as determinants to job performance.

Recommendations

Based on the findings and conclusion drawn, the following practical recommendations are made:

- (i) The university administration in North-Central, Nigeria should lay much emphasis on work itself, recognition and opportunities for achievement so that library personnel make positive contribution to job performance
- (ii) Management of university libraries in North-Central, Nigeria should provide adequate motivational incentives to enable library personnel develop positive attitude towards work. These can contribute and serve as determinants to job performance. There should be increase in salary, while fringe benefits such as shifting allowance, excess work load, furniture allowances, etc be created. On-the-job training programme such as in-house workshops be organized for junior staff.

References

- Akanbi, P. A. (2011). *Influence of extrinsic and intrinsic motivation on employees' performance*. Retrieved from www.ilo.org/public/english/iira/documents/congresses/regional/lagos2011.
- Bamigboye, O. B., Buraimo, O. K. & Ajani F. A. (2008). Job satisfaction and performance of academic librarians in Nigerian Universities in South-West Nigeria. *Information Technologist: An International Journal of Information and Communication Technology (ICT)*, 5(2), 91-100.
- Boluade, M. T. (2004). *A study of motivation, job performance and job satisfaction among staff of the National Library of Nigeria*. (Unpublished MLS Thesis), Ahmadu Bello University, Zaria, Nigeria.
- Dessler, G. (2011). *Human resource management*. 12th ed. Boston: Pearson.
- Etubi, M. & Ikekhai, M. O. (2007). Retrospective conversion: Our experience in University of Jos library. *Information Technologist: International Journal of Information and Communication Technology*, 4 (1), 92-94.
- Hafiza, N. S., Shah, S. S., Jamsheed, H. & Zaman, K. (2011). Relationship between rewards and employees' motivation of Pakistan. *Business Intelligent Journal*, 4(2), 327-334. Retrieved from www.saycooperative.com/sayco_uk/BL/journal/vol_4No2/Article
- Maduekwe, E. N. & Ajale, E. T. (2000). Staff development to meet the challenges of academic status for librarians working in Nigerian universities. *Library Bulletin: Journal of the Nigerian University Library System*, 5(1&2), 57 – 60.
- Notolooka, K. & Otenga, R. A. (2011). Labour turnover and employees' performance in Local Governments in Uganda: The Case of LIRA. *International Journal of Social and Policy Issues*, 8(1), 48-60.
- Olorunsola, E. O. (2010). *Job satisfaction and performance of administrative staff in South-West Nigerian universities*. (Unpublished Doctoral Thesis), University of Ado-Ekiti.

- Olusola, O. (2011). Intrinsic motivation, job satisfaction and self-efficacy as predictors of job performance of industrial workers in Ijebu Zone of Ogun State. *The Journal of International Social Research, Cilt: 4 say:17 volume: 41SSus 17 Bahr, 2011, Spring, 1-8*. Retrieved from www.sosyalastirmalar.com/cilt4/sa.
- Saka, K. A. & Haruna, I. (2013). Relationship between staff development and Job performance among personnel in branch libraries, University of Maduguri, Nigeria. *Mediterranean Journal of Social Sciences, Special Edition, 4(5), 9-17*. Also available online at www.mcser.org.
- Tella, A., Ayeni C. O. & Popoola, S. O. (2007). Work motivation, job satisfaction and organizational commitment of library personnel in academic and research libraries in Oyo state, Nigeria. *Library Philosophy and Practice (e-journal)*. Retrieved from <http://digitalcommons.un/edu/litphipract/118>.
- Ugwuanyi, R. N. C. (2011). Motivation in academic libraries: An imperative for efficient information delivery. *Nigerian Journal of Library, Archival and Information Science (NJLAIS): A publication of the University of Mkar, Mkar 1(12), 35-41*.
- Villamova, P., Austin, J. T. & Borman, W. (2005). Job performance. In C. Catwright, (Ed) *Blackwell Encyclopedia of Management*. (2nd ed). Vol. 5 In Austin, J. T. *et al*: (1991). United Kingdom: Blackwell Publishing Co., 208-209.
- Zakaria, Z., Hussain, Z. H., Norrdin, N., Sawal, M. H. M. & Zakaria, Z. (2011). The relationship between reward practice and employees performance: An empirical study 2011 *International Conference on Management and Artificial Intelligent IPEDR, 6(2011)*, Badi Indonesia: IACSIT press. Retrieved from www.ipedr.net/vol/6/28A 10023 pdf.